

Sent: Wed Apr 01 2009  
Subject: FOLLOW-UP QUESTION

**ROBERTS (STOPSMART)**

I have a question related to the document I sent on 3/31/09, which outlined the proposed SMART urban transit project. I have attached to the current email a SMART Committee Meeting Summary where on document page 2, (email page 3), there is some discussion as to whether PTC could qualify for a FRA shared track waiver in lieu of temporal separation from freight. My review of the July 10, 2000 FRA/FTA Notice and Final Rule does not indicate that PTC without temporal separation could qualify for the waiver but, of course, I'm not the expert. Please respond to this question at your earliest convenience.

**FRA SHARED USE PROJECT MANAGER**

Sir: The Policy is comprehensive and clear, and SMART is familiar with it. In lieu of temporal separation, the Petitioner must institute a system that offers total fail-safe separation of non-FRA compliant vehicles with the general railroad system. If SMART chooses a PTC system so it can operate mixed traffic, it has to demonstrate to the FRA Safety Board that its PTC system offers the same or equivalent degree of separation of the 2 types of vehicles-LRV's and freight equipment-as temporal separation does.

-----  
**ROBERTS (STOPSMART)**

Thank you for your quick and informative response. Do you have an example of a mixed traffic situation that has been granted the waiver based on PTC and not actual temporal separation?

**FRA SHARED USE PROJECT MANAGER**

No system has ever demonstrated a PTC system that was effective enough in lieu of temporal separation. None have ever petitioned the FRA and all seem to be content with Temporal Separation-it's cheaper than installing and retrofitting PTC

-----  
**ROBERTS (STOPSMART)**

I hope that you realize how valuable your prompt and informative responses are to me. How does the FRA determine if temporal separation is achieved? Is there a minimum time duration required between services?

**FRA SHARED USE PROJECT MANAGER**

Petitioning railroad files a Temporal Separation Plan with the FRA Region office. Details of the plan are up to the railroad. Temporal Separation involves a plan that includes derails at switches to prevent freight trains from entering the light rail during passenger period, dispatching protocols, etc. FRA reviews this thoroughly!

-----  
**ROBERTS (STOPSMART)**

Not quite sure that I understand your response. Are you saying that LRV derails could define the temporal period because there would be an LRV target for freight to potentially collide with? Therefore, in addition to the normal operating time period, the temporal time buffer would include the time required to clear the tracks (and a certain distance to centerline).

**FRA SHARED USE PROJECT MANAGER**

I have to see the SMART designs before passing any judgment.